



# FAMILY LAW

## Cases and Materials

### Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

1994-1995

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

Storage  
KF  
504  
92622  
1994  
v.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY  
SEP 6 1994  
FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**FAMILY LAW**

**Cases and Materials**

**Volume I**


**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**1994-1995**

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01roge\\_5](https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01roge_5)

# FAMILY LAW

## Table of Contents

### Volume I

#### Page No.

## I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

### A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents . . . . .	1
Note: Constitutional protection for the Family in Canada . . . . .	3
<i>MacLean's</i> , "Strong Family Ties" . . . . .	4
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Family top source of pleasure" . . . . .	5
Barrett and McIntosh, <i>The Anti-Social Family</i> . . . . .	6
Thorne, <i>Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions</i> . . . . .	8
Eichler, <i>Families in Canada Today</i> . . . . .	10
<i>Transition</i> , "The family in Canada" . . . . .	26
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Changing family unit will challenge judges, industry" . . . . .	28
Boyd, "Changing Canadian Family Forms" . . . . .	30

### B. Domestic Violence: The Dark Side of Families

Eichler, <i>Families in Canada Today</i> . . . . .	40
Johnson and Chisholm, "Family Homicide" . . . . .	43
Lupri, "Male Violence in the Home" . . . . .	44
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Relatives biggest killers of children" . . . . .	46
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "The twists and turns in family ties" . . . . .	47
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family" . . . . .	48
MacLeod, <i>Battered But Not Beaten</i> . . . . .	54
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Laying charges saves wives" . . . . .	59
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Justice system still full of pitfalls for abused women" . . . . .	60
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Calgary police took 21 minutes to heed rape victim's call" . . . . .	63
<i>Hyldtoft v. Hyldtoft</i> . . . . .	64
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family violence is manifestation of male power in society: Wilson" . . . . .	65
<i>Edmonton Journal v. A.G. Alta.</i> . . . . .	66
<i>R. v. Lavallee</i> . . . . .	67
<i>L. (A.) v. Crimes Compensation Board (Sask.)</i> , <i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> . . . . .	77

Freeman, <i>the Rights and Wrongs of Children</i> . . . . .	78
<i>Criminal Code</i> , s. 43 . . . . .	83
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Spanking was too harsh" . . . . .	83
<i>R. v. Baptiste</i> . . . . .	84
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family" . . . . .	86
<i>B. (A.) v. J. (I.) (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	89

### C. Legal Regulation of the Family

<i>Balfour v. Balfour</i> . . . . .	90
<i>Catholic Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan</i> <i>Toronto v. T.S.</i> . . . . .	92
Wald, "Introduction" to "Symposium: The Family, the State and the Law" . . . . .	96
Olsen, "The Family and the Market" . . . . .	98
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family" . . . . .	108
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> . . . . .	112
Glendon, <i>Abortion and Divorce in Western Law</i> . . . . .	120

## II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

### A. The Significance of Marriage

Vanier Institute, <i>Canadian Families</i> . . . . .	122
Cox, "Alternative Families" . . . . .	125
Freeman, discussion of <i>Sefton Holdings v. Cairns</i> . . . . .	127
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i> . . . . .	128
<i>Hyde v. Hyde</i> . . . . .	128
<i>Graham v. Graham</i> . . . . .	129
Day, "The Charter and Family Law" . . . . .	132
Note: Significance of Marriage for Indian Women . . . . .	134
Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" . . . . .	135
<i>R. v. Duvivier</i> . . . . .	143
<i>R. v. Salituro</i> . . . . .	146

### B. Validity of Marriage

#### (a) Overview

Hahlo, "Nullity of Marriage in Canada" . . . . .	148
McLeod, "Validity of Marriage" from <i>Introduction to Family Law</i> . . . . .	150



(b) Monogamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i> . . . . .	156
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Scads of Spouses" . . . . .	158
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Community practises polygamy" . . . . .	158
Note: Serial Monogamy . . . . .	160

(c) Capacity to Consummate

<i>Gajamugan v. Gajamugan</i> . . . . .	161
<i>Dashevsky v. Dashevsky</i> . . . . .	164
<i>Norman v. Norman</i> . . . . .	169

(d) Opposite Sexes

<i>Corbett v. Corbett</i> . . . . .	171
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Transsexual loses fight for change to birth certificate" . . . . .	173
<i>B. v. A.</i> . . . . .	174
<i>Anderson v. Luoma</i> . . . . .	181
<i>Layland and Beaulne v. Ontario</i> . . . . .	184
<i>Re Andrews</i> . . . . .	194
<i>Knodel v. British Columbia Medical Services Commission</i> . . . . .	195
<i>Veysey v. Canada (Correction Services)</i> . . . . .	196
<i>Leshner v. Ontario</i> . . . . .	196
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "NDP faces battle over gay rights" . . . . .	198
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Blue Cross plans appeal of ruling on spousal benefits" . . . . .	199
<i>Egan and North v. Canada</i> . . . . .	200
<i>Mossop v. Canada</i> . . . . .	202
Note: <i>Braschi v. Stahl</i> . . . . .	208
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Denmark allows homosexual marriage" . . . . .	209
Note: The "Registered Partnership in Denmark" Law, "Homosexuality and the Social Meaning of Gender" . . . . .	209
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage" . . . . .	211
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act (1993) . . . . .	214
Bill 167 . . . . .	220

(e) Consent

McLeod, <i>Introduction to Family Law</i> . . . . .	222
<i>Asser v. Peermohamed</i> . . . . .	227
<i>Singla v. Singla</i> . . . . .	232
<i>Truong (Malia) v. Malia</i> . . . . .	236
Note: Treatment of Marriage under the Immigration Act . . . . .	237
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Marriages of convenience out for immigrants" . . . . .	237

C. **Unmarried Cohabitation**

<i>Women in Canada: A Statistical Report</i> , "Common-law unions" . . . . .	238
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Common-law living on rise" . . . . .	239
Institute of Law Research and Reform, <i>Survey of Adult Living Arrangements</i> , "Summary of reasons for cohabiting" . . . . .	240
O'Donovan, "Legal Marriage - Who Needs It?" . . . . .	241
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> , "Informal Family Relations" . . . . .	246
Note: The Legislative Treatment of Unmarried Couples . . . . .	240
<i>Molodowich v. Penttinen</i> . . . . .	252
<i>Stoikiewicz v. Filas</i> . . . . .	260
<i>Re Labbe and McCullough</i> . . . . .	262
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Yolanda Ballard seeking \$16,050 a month" . . . . .	264
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Yolanda Ballard gets \$7,000 a month" . . . . .	265
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Ottawa gives up on persecuting Olive" . . . . .	266
Leighton, "Handmaids' Tales: Family Benefits Assistance and the Single-Mother-Led Family" . . . . .	268
Note: Subsequent Amendments to the FBA Regulations . . . . .	271
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act (1993) . . . . .	272



### III. DIVORCE

#### A. The Social Context of Divorce

Adams, "Divorce Rates in Canada" . . . . .	274
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> . . . . .	276
Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crisis on Marriage Breakdown" . . . . .	281
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Marital Upheaval" . . . . .	284
Richardson, "Children of Divorce" . . . . .	285

#### B. Reform of Divorce Law

##### (a) Movement to No-Fault Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" . . . . .	292
Abella, "Opening Address" in Sloss, ed., <i>Family Law in Canada</i> . . . . .	296
Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Act</i> . . . . .	300
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "A History of Divorce" . . . . .	304
Collins, "On Canadian Public Policy-Makers" in <i>The Big Evasion</i> . . . . .	305
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Background and Evaluation Issues" . . . . .	306
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Reducing the Adversarial Process" . . . . .	315

##### (b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

R.E.A.L. Women, "Easy Divorce?" . . . . .	317
Amiel, "The Fault in No-Fault Divorce" . . . . .	319
Weitzman, "Divorce and the Illusion of Equality" . . . . .	320
Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children" . . . . .	326

##### (c) Grounds for Divorce

###### (i) Living Separate and Apart

<i>Rushton v. Rushton</i> . . . . .	327
<i>Dupere v. Dupere</i> . . . . .	328
Note: "Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division under the <i>Family Law Act</i> " . . . . .	330

(ii) Adultery

Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Law</i> , "definition of Adultery" . . . . .	332
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> . . . . .	333
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge" . . . . .	334
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , re Brazilian defence of honour . . . . .	335
<i>Masterlerz v. Garland</i> . . . . .	336
<i>Davenport v. Miller</i> . . . . .	339
<i>Orford v. Orford</i> . . . . .	343
<i>MacLennan v. MacLennan</i> . . . . .	345

(iii) Cruelty

<i>Knoll v. Knoll</i> . . . . .	348
<i>Austin v. Austin</i> . . . . .	351
<i>Gilbert v. Gilbert</i> . . . . .	352
<i>B.(Y.) v. B.(J.)</i> . . . . .	356
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce" . . . . .	358
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?" . . . . .	359
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Battered woman wins suit" . . . . .	362

(d) Bars to Proceedings(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion

Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , "Condonation" . . . . .	363
<i>Guglielmo v. Mikhail (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	365
Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , "Connivance" and "Collusion" . . . . .	366

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support

<i>R.D.F. v. S.L.F.</i> . . . . .	369
Note: <i>MacKinnon, Bergman, Schultz, Simpson</i> . . . . .	372
Note: <i>Harper v. Harper</i> . . . . .	374

(iii) Removal of Barriers to Religious Divorce

<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "The ties that continue to bind" . . . . .	375
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Religious laws to be removed as 'bargaining chip' in divorces" . . . . .	377

**C. Institutional Reforms: Mediation**

Landau, "Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families" . . . . .	378
Woods, "Mediation: A Backlash to Women's Progress on Family Law Issues" . . . . .	387
Payne and Overend, "Divorce Mediation: An Overview of Process and Strategies" . . . . .	390
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Even for battered wives mediation is endorsed as an option in divorce" . . . . .	402

**IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN****A. The Economics of Marriage**

Moller Okin, <i>Justice, Gender and the Family</i> . . . . .	403
Armstrong and Armstrong, "Woman, Family and Economy" . . . . .	405
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Women sacrifice career plans for family" . . . . .	409
Gunderson, <i>Women and Labour Market Poverty</i> . . . . .	410
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Study finds chores not shared" . . . . .	413

**B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce**

Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War" . . . . .	414
Weitzman, "The Economics of Divorce" . . . . .	424
National Council of Welfare, <i>Women and Poverty Revisited</i> . . . . .	425
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> . . . . .	444
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family law reform can't solve divorce poverty? . . . . .	449

